## POINTWISE CONVERGENCE OF THE ITERATES OF A HARRIS-RECURRENT MARKOV OPERATOR

## BY SHLOMO HOROWITZ<sup>\*</sup>

## ABSTRACT

Let P be a Markov operator recurrent in the sense of Harris, with  $\sigma$ -finite invariant measure  $\mu$ . (1) If  $\mu$  is finite and P aperiodic, then for  $f \in L_1(\mu)$ ,  $P^n f \to \int f d\mu$  a.e. (2) If  $\mu$  is infinite,  $P^n f \to 0$  a.e. for every  $f \in L_p(\mu)$ ,  $1 \le p < \infty$ .

Let P(x, A) be a transition probability on the measurable space  $(X, \Sigma)$ , and denote also by P the operator on  $B(X, \Sigma)$  defined by  $Pf(x) = \int f(y)P(x, dy)$ . P is *Harris-recurrent* if for a  $\sigma$ -finite measure m we have  $m(A) > 0 \Rightarrow \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} P^n 1_A(x) = \infty$  for every x. It is well-known (see, for example, [2], [8]) that if P is Harris-recurrent, then there is a unique  $\sigma$ -finite measure  $\mu$ , invariant for P. We then have  $m \ll \mu$ , and also  $\mu(A) > 0 \Rightarrow \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} P^n 1_A(x) = \infty$  for every x.

The purpose of this note is to prove the following almost everywhere convergence theorems for functions in  $L_p(\mu)$ . The results are known for *bounded* functions in  $L_p(\mu)$  (see, for example, [2], [8], [5]). Harris-recurrence is treated in [2] and [8].

THEOREM 1. Let P be Harris-recurrent with finite invariant measure  $\mu$ . If P is aperiodic, then for every  $f \in L_1(\mu)$  we have  $P^n f(x) \rightarrow \int f d\mu$  a.e.

THEOREM 2. Let P be Harris recurrent with infinite  $\sigma$ -finite invariant measure  $\mu$ . Then for every  $f \in L_p(\mu)$ ,  $1 \leq p < \infty$ , we have  $P^n f(x) \rightarrow 0$  a.e.

For the proof we need the following lemma, due to Orey [7] (see also [8]).

Received November 1, 1978

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>+</sup>Dr. Shlomo Horowitz died before completing the manuscript. He left a draft, to which I added the last paragraph, references, title and abstract. I made only slight modifications in a place or two in the proofs, for clarity (M. Lin).

LEMMA 1. Let  $\Sigma$  be separable and P Harris-recurrent. Then there exist an integer k, a  $\Sigma \times \Sigma$  measurable function  $q(x, y) \ge 0$ , and sets  $B, C \in \Sigma$  (with  $\mu(B)\mu(C) > 0$ ), such that:

- (a)  $P^k \ge Q > 0$ , where  $Qf(x) = \int q(x, y)f(y)\mu(dy)$ .
- (b)  $\inf\{q(x, y): x \in B, y \in C\} = \alpha > 0.$
- (c) P<sup>k</sup> is Harris-recurrent.

As a consequence of this lemma, we get that  $P^{k} \ge Q \ge \alpha \mathbf{1}_{B} \bigotimes \mu I_{c}$ .

The following lemmas are well-known. The case  $U = PI_A$  is shown in [2], but the proof is valid for the general case.

LEMMA 2. If P > U > 0, then  $U^{n} \downarrow 0$  a.e.

**PROOF.** U"1 decreases, so let  $U^n \downarrow h$ . Then  $Uh = h \Rightarrow Ph \ge h \Rightarrow Ph = h$ , so h = const, since P is conservative and ergodic in  $L_{\infty}(\mu)$ . Hence Uh = h = c1, and, if  $c \ne 0$ , U1 = 1. Since P > U, we have a contradiction. Hence c = 0.

LEMMA 3. If P > U > 0, then  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (P - U)^n U = 1$  a.e.

**PROOF.** Since U = P - (P - U), we have

$$\sum_{n=0}^{N} (P-U)^{n} U 1 = \sum_{n=0}^{N} (P-U)^{n} 1 - \sum_{n=1}^{N+1} (P-U)^{n} 1 = 1 - (P-U)^{N+1} 1$$

Let  $N \rightarrow \infty$  and apply Lemma 2 (to P - U).

LEMMA 4. Let P > U > 0. If  $0 \le f \in L_p(\mu)$ ,  $1 \le p < \infty$  (and  $\mu P = \mu$ ), then  $(P - U)^n f \to 0$  a.e.

PROOF. The proof of Lemma 2 shows that P - U has no superinvariant functions in  $L_{\infty}$ . Hence P - U is either dissipative or conservative. Since  $\mu (P - U) \leq \mu$ , the same applies to (P - U)g as an operator of  $L_1(\mu)$  ([2, p. 76]), and by Lemma 3 we must have that P - U is dissipative. Hence, for  $0 \leq f \in L_1(\mu)$  we have  $\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (P - U)^n f < \infty$  a.e., hence  $(P - U)^n f \to 0$  a.e. If  $0 \leq f \in L_p(\mu)$ , then  $f \leq 1 + (f - 1)^+$ , with  $(f - 1)^+ \in L_1(\mu)$ . Hence

$$(P-U)^n f \leq (P-U)^n 1 + (P-U)^n (f-1)^+ \to 0$$
 a.e.

**LEMMA 5.** Let P be Harris-aperiodic with finite invariant measure  $\mu$ , and let  $\Sigma$  be separable. If  $C \in \Sigma$ , and  $f \in L_1(\mu)$  satisfies  $\int f d\mu = 0$ , then  $\int P^n f \cdot 1_C d\mu \to 0$ .

**PROOF.** The Harris-recurrence condition implies, by Lemma 1, the Harris condition as given in [2], and the dual Markov operator  $P^*$  is also aperiodic Harris [2], and  $P^{**}1_C \rightarrow \mu(C)$  a.e. ([2], [5]). Hence

$$\int P^n f \cdot 1_C d\mu = \int f P^{*n} 1_C d\mu \to \mu(C) \int f d\mu = 0.$$

LEMMA 6. Let P be Harris with infinite  $\sigma$ -finite invariant measure  $\mu$ , and let  $\Sigma$  be separable. If  $C \in \Sigma$  with  $\mu(C) < \infty$ , and  $0 \le f \in L_p(\mu)$ ,  $1 \le p < \infty$ , then  $\int P^n f \cdot 1_C d\mu \to 0$ .

**PROOF.** If  $f \in L_1(\mu)$ , the proof is as before, except that  $P^{*n}1_C \to 0$  a.e. If  $f \in L_p(\mu)$ ,  $1 , then for <math>\varepsilon > 0$  write f = g + h, with  $g \in L_1(\mu)$  and  $||h||_p < \varepsilon$ . Then  $\int P^n g \cdot 1_C d\mu \to 0$ , and  $0 \leq \int P^n h \cdot 1_C d\mu \leq \varepsilon \mu (C)^{1/q}$  (with q = p/(p-1)), since P is a contraction of  $L_p(\mu)$ . The lemma now follows.

The next lemma is an abstraction of the "first entrance formula", and can be proved by induction.

LEMMA 7. Let a, b be elements of a ring. Then

$$a^{n} = \sum_{k=0}^{n-1} (a-b)^{k} b a^{n-1-k} + (a-b)^{n}.$$

**PROOF OF THEOREMS 1 AND 2.** We first assume that  $\Sigma$  is separable, and Lemma 1 can be applied. We may assume that in Lemma 1, k = 1 (otherwise we prove the theorem for  $P^k$ , and then apply it to the functions  $P^if$ ,  $0 \le j \le k - 1$ ).

Choose in Lemma 7, a = P,  $b = \alpha 1_B \otimes \mu I_C$ , and obtain

$$P^{n}f(x) = \sum_{k=0}^{n-1} \left(P - \alpha \mathbf{1}_{B} \otimes \mu I_{C}\right)^{k} \alpha \mathbf{1}_{B}(x) \int P^{n-1-k}f \cdot \mathbf{1}_{C}d\mu + \left(P - \alpha \mathbf{1}_{B} \otimes \mu I_{C}\right)^{n}f(x).$$

For Theorem 1 we assume, w.l.g.,  $\int f d\mu = 0$ . By Lemma 4 the last term tends to 0. Since  $\mu(C) < \infty$ , by Lemmas 5 and  $\int \int P^n f \cdot 1_C d\mu \to 0$ , and, by Lemma 3,

$$\mu(C)\sum_{k=0}^{\infty} (P-\alpha \mathbf{1}_B \otimes \mu I_C)^k \alpha \mathbf{1}_B(x) = 1.$$

After excluding a set of measure 0, for  $\varepsilon > 0$  and  $x \in X$  there is an N such that

$$\sum_{k=N}^{\infty} (P - \alpha \mathbf{1}_B \otimes \mu I_C)^k \alpha \mathbf{1}_B(x) < \varepsilon,$$

and

$$\int P^n f \cdot 1_C d\mu < \varepsilon \qquad \text{for } n > N.$$

Then, for n > 2N, we have

$$\sum_{k=0}^{N} (P - \alpha \mathbf{1}_{B} \otimes \mu I_{C})^{k} \alpha \mathbf{1}_{B}(x) \int P^{n-1-k} f \cdot \mathbf{1}_{C} d\mu < \varepsilon \sum_{k=0}^{N} (P - \alpha \mathbf{1}_{B} \otimes \mu I_{C})^{k} \alpha \mathbf{1}_{B}(x) \leq \varepsilon / \mu (C),$$

and

$$\sum_{k=N+1}^{n-1} \left( P - \alpha \mathbf{1}_B \bigotimes \mu I_C \right)^k \alpha \mathbf{1}_B(x) \int P^{n-1-k} f \cdot \mathbf{1}_C d\mu \leq \varepsilon \| f \|_p \| \mathbf{1}_C \|_q$$

and the theorems are proved, in case that  $\Sigma$  is separable.

For the case that  $\Sigma$  is not separable, we take the *admissible*  $\sigma$ -field,  $\Sigma' \subset \Sigma$  such that f is  $\Sigma'$  measurable,  $\Sigma'$  is separable, and  $B(X, \Sigma')$  is invariant for P (see [1, p. 209]).

REMARKS. (1) If we deal with the abstract Harris condition, as used in [2], we can get to the Harris-recurrence condition via the method in [3], or (after reduction to the separable case, as above) via [4].

(2) Theorem 2 is given a different proof in [6, theor. 3]. The assumption there for our Theorem 2 is also of aperiodicity (with only a sketch of proof). The approach in this note is simpler.

## References

1. J. L. Doob, Stochastic Processes, Wiley, New York, 1953.

2. S. R. Foguel, Ergodic Theory of Markov Processes, Van Nostrand-Reinhold, New York, 1969.

3. S. Horowitz, Transition probabilities and contractions of  $L_{\infty}$ , Z. Wahrscheinlichkeitstheorie 24 (1972), 263-274.

4. N. C. Jain, A note on invariant measures, Ann. Math. Statist. 37 (1966), 729-732.

5. N. C. Jain, Some limit theorems for a general Markov process, Z. Wahrscheinlichkeitstheorie 6 (1966), 206-223.

6. E. Nummelin and R. L. Tweedie, Geometric ergodicity and R-positivity for general Markov chains, Ann. Probability, to appear.

7. S. Orey, Recurrent Markov chains, Pacific J. Math. 9 (1959), 805-827.

8. S. Orey, Lecture Notes on Limit Theorems for Markov Chain Transition Probabilities, Van Nostrand, New York, 1971.

TEL AVIV UNIVERSITY RAMAT AVIV TEL AVIV, ISRAEL